

**COUNTY GOVERNMENT OF KISUMU**



**COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KISUMU**

**THE HANSARD**

**SECOND ASSEMBLY – FOURTH SESSION**

**Wednesday, 19<sup>th</sup> August, 2020**

**House met in the Main Chamber at 02:30 p.m.**

**(The Speaker (Hon. Elisha Jack Oraro) in the Chair)**

**PRAYERS**

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Good afternoon Hon. Members and welcome to this afternoon session. Can the Clerk please take us through the Order of the day?

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Next order!

**COMMUNICATION FROM THE CHAIR**

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Honourable Members, I would like to communicate that the Zoom App is on. The password has been sent to the WhatsApp Group so you can inform the Members who are attending online that the password has been sent to the said platform.

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Next order!

**PAPER LAID**

**THE AGRICULTURE, LIVESTOCK AND FISHERIES COMMITTEE REPORT ON THE CONSULTATIVE FORUM, SITE VISITS TO MASENO ATC AND ASSESSMENT OF THE BENEFICIARIES OF THE LIVESTOCK DISTRIBUTION PROGRAM BY THE DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE, LIVESTOCK AND FISHERIES**

**BY**

HON. VITALIS OTURA

CHAIRPERSON, AGRICULTURE, LIVESTOCK AND FISHERIES COMMITTEE

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Yes Hon. Otura.

**Hon. Otura:** Thank you Mr. Speaker. Pursuant to the provision of the County Assembly Standing Order 182 (6), I wish to lay today Wednesday 19<sup>th</sup> August, 2020, the Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries Committee Report on the Consultative Forum, Site Visits to Maseno ATC and Assessment of the Beneficiaries of the Livestock Distribution Program by the Department of Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries.

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Honourable Members, I confirm the receipt of the Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries Committee report on the consultative forum, Site Visits to Maseno ATC and Assessment of the Beneficiaries of the Livestock Distribution Program by the Department of Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries. Presented by Hon. Vitalis Otura, Chairperson, Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries. I do hereby commit this report to the House Business Committee for the purposes of scheduling it for discussion in the plenary.

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Next order!

#### NOTICE OF MOTION

THE AGRICULTURE, LIVESTOCK AND FISHERIES COMMITTEE REPORT ON THE CONSULTATIVE FORUM, SITE VISITS TO MASENO ATC AND ASSESSMENT OF THE BENEFICIARIES OF THE LIVESTOCK DISTRIBUTION PROGRAM BY THE DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE, LIVESTOCK AND FISHERIES

BY

HON. VITALIS OTURA

CHAIRPERSON, AGRICULTURE, LIVESTOCK AND FISHERIES COMMITTEE

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Yes Hon. Otura.

**Hon. Otura:** Thank you Mr. Speaker. Pursuant to the provision of the County Assembly Standing Order 45, I wish to give a Notice of Motion on Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries Committee report on the Consultative Forum, Site Visits to Maseno ATC and Assessment of the Beneficiaries of the Livestock Distribution Program by the Department of Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries. Thank you.

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Next order!

## COMMENCEMENT OF BUSINESS

### MOTION

COMMITTEE ON LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE PROGRESS REPORT ON THE STATUS OF COMMUNITY HEALTH WORKERS AND CASUAL LABOURERS IN THE HEALTH FACILITIES IN KISUMU COUNTY

BY

HON. RASHID MIRUKA

CHAIRPERSON, LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE COMMITTEE

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Yes Hon. Rashid Miruka.

**Hon. Miruka:** Thank you Mr. Speaker. The Labour and Social Welfare Committee in its meeting noted that since the House will be adjourning for the long recess effective 13<sup>th</sup> July 2020 to 11<sup>th</sup> August 2020 and there were pending matters that had not been handled, it was wise that the Committee invoke the provisions of Standing Order No. 165 and make a formal request to the Office of the Speaker to authorize the Committee to convene its sittings during the recess to enable it conclude the works that were scheduled and were time constrained as a result of the COVID-19 Pandemic that compelled the Assembly to adhere to government directives that regulated gathering of its Kenyan citizens to help in preventing the risk of transmission.

The Committee communicated to the Office of the Speaker to allow it to convene special sittings as from 16<sup>th</sup> July 2020 to 6<sup>th</sup> August 2020 via an internal memo from the Chairperson of the Committee dated 7<sup>th</sup> July 2020.

The Hon. Speaker agreed to the request and instructed the Committee to prepare a workplan of activities together with the dates and clear objectives for the intended sittings, which the Committee obliged and was approved by the Speaker.

The Mandate of the Committee

The sectoral Committee of Labour and Social Welfare is established pursuant to the provisions of the Standing Orders No. 193 of the County Assembly of Kisumu, which states that:

- (1) There shall be select Committees to be known as Sectoral Committees the Members of which shall be nominated by the County Assembly Business Committee in consultation with County Assembly parties at the commencement of every County Assembly.

- (2) A Member appointed to a Sectoral Committee at the commencement of a County Assembly or at any other time during the term of a County Assembly shall, unless the County Assembly otherwise resolves, serve for the term of that County Assembly.

#### Legal Framework, and the Functions and Responsibilities of the Committee

As a sectoral Committee, we draw our mandates from Standing Order No. 193 (5) which provides the following functions:

- a) Investigate, inquire into, and report on all matters relating to the mandate, management, activities, administration, operations and estimates of the assigned departments;
- b) Study of the programme and policy objectives of departments and the effectiveness of the implementation;
- c) Study and review all County legislation referred to it;
- d) Study, assess and analyze the relative success of the departments as measured by the results obtained as compared with their stated objectives;
- e) Investigate and inquire into all matters relating to the assigned departments as they may deem necessary, and as may be referred to them by the County Assembly;
- f) To vet and report on all appointments where the Constitution or any law requires the County Assembly to approve, except those under Standing Order 187 (*Committee on Appointments*) and;
- g) Make reports and recommendations to the County Assembly as often as possible, including recommendation of proposed legislation.

#### The Composition of the Committee

The Committee as currently constituted comprises of the following:

- |                              |   |                  |
|------------------------------|---|------------------|
| 1. Hon. Rashid Miruka        | - | Chairperson      |
| 2. Hon. Consolata Ollows     | - | Vice Chairperson |
| 3. Hon. Benny Pete Oiko      | - | Member           |
| 4. Hon. Jenipher Obonyo      | - | Member           |
| 5. Hon. Prisca Misachi       | - | Member           |
| 6. Hon. Florence Olang'o     | - | Member           |
| 7. Hon. Samson Ameso         | - | Member           |
| 8. Hon. Johnson Guya         | - | Member           |
| 9. Hon. Lynnette Carren Muga | - | Member           |

- |                             |   |        |
|-----------------------------|---|--------|
| 10. Hon. Vincent Jagongo    | - | Member |
| 11. Hon. Inviolete Adhiambo | - | Member |
| 12. Hon. Habil Nyasuna      | - | Member |
| 13. Hon. Julius Genga       | - | Member |
| 14. Hon. John Atieno Otieno | - | Member |
| 15. Hon. Jacktone Ogendo    | - | Member |

#### Secretariat

- |                           |   |                  |
|---------------------------|---|------------------|
| 1. Mr. Nelco Sagwe        | - | Committee Clerk  |
| 2. Ms. Elizabeth Achieng' | - | Clerk Assistant  |
| 3. Mr. Fanuel Okode       | - | Hansard          |
| 4. Ms. Rispah Auma        | - | Sergeant-at-Arms |

#### Committee Sitings

The Committee held two sittings to deliberate on the statement raised in the House by Hon. Benny Pete Oiko regarding the County Community Health Workers (Nyamrerwa) and Casual Labourers in the County health facilities.

The first sitting was held on 23<sup>rd</sup> July 2020 and the second sitting was held on 6<sup>th</sup> August 2020.

#### Acknowledgment

The Committee wishes to thank the Speaker of the County Assembly of Kisumu and the Clerk of the County Assembly of Kisumu for the goodwill extended to the Committee to fulfill its mandate and to carry out its activities.

The Committee also appreciates the role and contribution of all members of staff who have been instrumental during the whole process culminating in the production of this progress report.

Mr. Speaker and Hon. Members, Part of this report is an attempt by the committee to get to the bottom of the matter.

#### THE STATUS OF COMMUNITY HEALTH WORKERS (NYAMRERWA) AND CASUAL LABOURERS IN THE HEALTH FACILITIES IN KISUMU COUNTY

On a statement raised in the House regarding the status of Community Health Workers and Casual Labourers in Kisumu County, the Committee made a formal request to the Department of Health and Sanitation vide letter ref: CAK/CGK/CS/VOL.V/24/6/20 dated 4<sup>th</sup> June 2020 that the Department provide the following (Annexure 2 & 3):

- a) The total number of Kisumu County Community Health Workers and the list per ward.
- b) The engagement date/ the time they started working
- c) The evidence that they are being paid Kenya Shillings 2,500 per month and is up to date or in arrears and the total arrears.
- d) That the County pays for their National Hospital Insurance Fund promptly.
- e) The total number of Kisumu County Casual Labourers per health facility.
- f) If the wages of the casual Labourers is up to date or in arrears and if in arrears, how much is outstanding and for how long have they not been paid and why.

The Health and Sanitation Department partially responded to the Committee on 26<sup>th</sup> May 2020 vide the letter ref: GN 133 VOL.IV (401) (Annexure 4) and later vide letter ref: GN133VOL.IV/ (482) dated 20<sup>th</sup> July 2020 (Annexure 5) with the assurance that the issue on the status of Community Health Workers and Casual Labourers in the County is provided to the Committee.

The Committee not being satisfied with the response, made another communication vide letter ref: CAK/CGK/CORR/07/20/VOL.IV dated 29<sup>th</sup> July 2020 (Annexure 6) for the Health and Sanitation Department to give a more detailed and comprehensive response on the following:

- a) That they provide evidence that the Community Health Volunteers and Casual Labourers in the Health Facilities have been paid their wages by end of June 2020 as indicated in the report they presented to the Committee (An extract of the payrolls should have been attached).
- b) That all the Health Facilities, Dispensaries and Centers run by the County Government of Kisumu are included in their report.
- c) That they confirm whether all Casual Labourers in all County Health Facilities, dispensaries and centers were included in the submitted list.
- d) That they provide the Status of the NHIF cover for Community Health Volunteers and Casual Labourers in the Health Facilities.

Hon. House, by the expiry of 12<sup>th</sup> August 2020, the Department of Health and Sanitation had not provided the comprehensive response.

Mr. Speaker, this is the progress report of the Committee since the day the statement was raised before the House and it is following up with the Department of Health and Sanitation to ensure that the final report will be presented before this Honourable House for debate and for onward adoption.

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Honourable Members, you have heard what Hon. Rashid has presented. We were under motions but he has only presented a progress report. I don't know what you have done because this report was supposed to come immediately after recess. I think it

is in order to tell Members what you have done when you realized that the report given was not sufficient.

**Hon. Miruka:** Mr. Speaker, we did a communication to the Chief Officer Health and the Clerk also made a call to the said Officer this morning and he assured him that we shall receive a comprehensive report by tomorrow. Thank you.

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): I think it is in order if I give opportunity for the Members to say something on the progress report given by Hon. Miruka.

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Yes Hon. Steve.

**Hon. Steve:** Thank you Mr. Speaker. Listening to the report given by the Chair, we realize that the issue of the Community Health Workers is a very thorny issue to most of us who are representing the people on the ground. The kind of the work the Community Health Workers do in the villages is quite important that we cannot take for granted.

Mr. Speaker, I believe that when the Honourable Member for Kabonyo Kanyagwal raised the Statement; it was not only for him but for the interest of the whole County. The answer that has been given shows that this matter is not being taken seriously. From the very beginning, the Department of Health has mishandled the issue of Health workers. I would start from the point of recruitment. When you go to the village and ask whether the Community Health Workers were recruited, you will realize that there has been a serious problem. When the stipend payment was introduced, we expected that most of the people who have been involved in the community health work would benefit.

Mr. Speaker, it is true that when you ask our Community Health Workers, they would tell you that they have not received this payment for varying periods. Others for eight months while some have only received once. This is unacceptable. However, when you look at the financial reports, it is indicated that the payments have been made.

Mr. Speaker, I want to ask that, this matter be treated with the seriousness that it deserves and the responsible House Committee should not beg the officers in charge of the community health workers. They should be summoned to appear before this Assembly so that they respond to concerns raised. I am saying they have to be summoned because this was one of the most important pledges made to our people. Remember that the County Government under the leadership of Prof. Nyong'o promised the people of Kisumu County that among ten things that would be done within a hundred days is giving stipend to Community Health Workers.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, it is not lost to me that the Governor and his team did implement the payment of community health workers. I remember this was launched in my Ward at Angola dispensary. To date, the Community Health Workers or volunteers are still wondering what happened to their payment. I think the Labour Committee together with the Health Committee in whose

docket this matter lies needs to rise to the occasion and give us a clear picture of the fate of community health workers.

Mr. Speaker and Honourable Members, I want to plead that action should be taken against those people who have willfully refused to provide us with relevant information on this matter. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): I had noticed Hon. Vincent Jagongo, Chair for Health and MCA North West Kisumu. Hon. Seth you will be next. I have noticed you Hon. Arao. Proceed Hon. Jagongo

**Hon. Jagongo:** Thank you Mr. Speaker. As a Member of the Labour Committee, I agree with the partial report that has been communicated to us through the Chair of Labour. However, I think there is a problem because the Community Health Workers were employed sometimes back, I believe it was more than a year ago. I do not believe that the department can fail to get a report on how they have been paid, the amount paid and if there could be any issues with their National Hospital Insurance Fund (NHIF).

Mr. Speaker, I am aware that they have not been paid the NHIF money yet every month, Community Health Workers are deducted Statutory amount of Kshs. 500.00 for NHIF. This money is not being remitted to NHIF and as we speak, if any of them falls sick, they will have nowhere to get treatment. These are the people helping us in doing all sorts of work in the villages like giving us data. I believe it is a serious issue that needs to be looked into.

Mr. Speaker, I would want to, with your indulgence that the Department of Health and that of Finance be summoned. The Department of Finance deals with payment including that of NHIF. I would ask that we compel them to appear before the General Oversight Committee and furnish us with a comprehensive report on the whereabouts of NHIF funds meant for our Community Health Workers. I would want to urge that we summon both the two departments. I remember sometimes back when the issue was raised in this Assembly and we were told that it was being sorted. I do not think they can take a whole year to sort this.

Let us compel them to give us a way forward on NHIF money. On the issue of Casual Workers within Kisumu County, I do not think that they should take a year to give us a report on this. Let us get that report as well because people are employed and they have been working in the hospitals. Finance department should prepare a similar report. The letter should be directed to the two departments: Finance and Health. Thank you.

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Hon. Seth Okumu.

**Hon. Okumu:** Thank you. Mr. Speaker, I want to say that the matter that was brought before Labour Committee is a serious matter.



Mr. Speaker, I once went to a Sub County hospital on a day when the CHVs were meeting. They invited me to their meeting and we discussed a lot one of which was the issue of NHIF and NSSF.

Mr. Speaker, the Community Health Volunteers (CHVs) are an integral part on the delivery of our health systems. We cannot ignore them when they raise valid concerns. The Governor promised in his manifesto that the Community Health Volunteers (CHVs) will be paid some stipend alongside NHIF cover and NSSF. Mr. Speaker, we need to make a resolution as a House to tell them that we are committed to the welfare. I am not satisfied with the report that has been brought before us because they have not given us good conclusions especially with regard to getting vital documents by a House tasked with oversight role.

Mr. Speaker, we must show direction to this County. We cannot work with a department that cannot prove to us how they have paid employees in this County from March 2019. There is something we need to do as an oversight team. I am requesting that because the Labour Committee seems to be so lenient and they do not want to take stern action, as a practice in this House and if it is agreeable among Members, then with your indulgence, you constitute an Ad-hoc Committee to help them fasttrack this issue of Community Health Volunteers is solved forthwith. We cannot have people helping us in improving the statistics of Health in this County yet we cannot pay them as we had promised them or even prove that we are paying them because these are issues that are budgeted for in the Budget but the money can't be accounted for. It is true as the Chairperson has said that they are being deducted Kshs. 500.00 for National Hospital Insurance Fund, but where are these funds remitted? Nobody can prove that Mr. Speaker. Honorable Members, it is time for us to rise to the occasion and help the Community Health Volunteers because they help us achieve our manifesto on Health. Thank you so much Mr. Speaker, those are my submissions for now.

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Allow me to give Senior Member Hon. Priscah Misachi.

**Hon. Misachi:** Thank you Mr. Speaker, I want to support the scenario of the Chairperson of Health Committee to address both the Health and Finance Department because these people have a problem with the payment. We wanted the records from the Health Department. The Labour Committee should also be joined by the Health Committee so that we conclude on it. We do not have to discuss about the Ad-Hoc Committee at this early stage because it is just the document of the records of how remittances are done to the NHIF which is lacking. The engagement of both Finance and Health Departments will enable a conclusive report of the same. I support the statement of the Chairperson of Health Department, thank you.

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): I had noticed Hon. Arao. I will give you a chance Hon. Atieno.

**Hon. Arao:** Thank you Mr. Speaker, when you read this report, you will realize that there is a common disease in almost every Department at the Executive wing. I don't know whether it is a tradition or negligence...

**Hon. Owiti:** Point of information Mr. Speaker?

**The Speaker (Hon. Oraro):** What is it Hon. Steve Owiti? Who do you want to inform?

**Hon. Owiti:** *(On a point of information).* Thank you, Mr. Speaker, I am not sure if the speaker on the floor Hon. Arao is properly dressed in the right decorum to participate in this House.

**Hon. Arao:** Pardon me Hon. Speaker, my tie just fell down but there is no tailor around.

**The Speaker (Hon. Oraro):** The Sergeant-at-Arms will help you dress properly then you resume. Meanwhile, Hon. Atieno the floor is yours.

**Hon. Atieno:** Thank you Mr. Speaker for this opportunity, I want to thank the author of the statement, Hon. Pete Oiko for coming up with this important statement concerning Community Health Volunteers. I believe they should no longer be referred to as Community Health Volunteers but rather Community Health Workers (CHWs). It is quite shameful for us to be discussing this issue on the floor of this House because these are people who are doing a great job for members of this County. In addition, they are just paid Kshs 2500.00 per month which is a mere token and very little at that yet we can pay them. It is therefore upon this House to demand the responses from the line department as soon as possible the reason why they cannot pay these workers their dues. The other issue that raised my emotions was the submission by the Hon. Chairperson of the Department of Health about the deductions of Kshs 500.00 made every month intended for NHIF yet the money is not remitted. This is a criminal offence Mr. Speaker, and the House needs to go deeper in to this for us to know if truly the money is being deducted every month, and if so, then, investigate where it goes then deal with the culprits. Suppose these people fall sick, which is very likely, how do they get treated? We are aware that receiving treatment without a health cover is very expensive.

I ask the Hon. House to move with speed and compel the line department to give us the responses that were sought by Hon. Benny Pete Oiko. Otherwise thank you and God bless this honorable House. Thank you.

**The Speaker (Hon. Oraro):** I had noticed Hon. Ken Ooko first then Hon. Maureen Otiang'

**Hon. Ooko:** Thank you Mr. Speaker. I have gone through this progress report and I have been asking myself questions of whether it is a progress report or a Zero Report. My reason for saying this is because in the evidence, the department is mentioning dates and months that the payment have been made but Hon. Oiko asked the amount that has been paid and evidence of the payments made. They are showing months that they made payments without evidence of the

actual payments. There is one thing I do not understand from the Chairperson of the Labour Committee, as he was giving us a progressive report at the same time telling us that the Department will give a Comprehensive Report tomorrow. What was the rush for in presenting to us the Report today? This is serious issue we are dealing with and I think we should take serious action against this department. In the villages the Community Health Volunteers are doing a great job but they feel demotivated and I think this should be last time we are discussing the issue of Community Health Volunteers.

Consequently, the issue of NHIF cash remittance is also very critical not only to the CHVs but also to other County workers. Mr. Speaker I want to ask if the Department of Health and that of Finance be summoned to this Assembly so that the matter is squared forthwith.

Mr. Speaker. I am very disappointed that this Hon. House can ask to be provided with a comprehensive response and a Department declines. According to this report, the Health Department did not give a comprehensive report on the issues raised. It is time we should take serious action by putting the executive to provide response on issues raised in the Assembly. We are elected to represent our electorates and when we seek answers, we don't do so for ourselves but for the people and that should be taken seriously. The Department did not respond as was required and if possible the House should summon them so that they can give response in a common sitting for them to know that we are serious. We cannot allow officers to be lazy and refuse to do what they are supposed to. They are letting the county down including H.E. the Governor. So I concur with Members that we should look into this matter seriously. Thank you.

**Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): I had noticed Hon. George Ogutu, then Hon. Roy Samo.

**Hon. Ogutu:** Thank you Mr. Speaker. First, let us agree that there is a problem. Going by the contributions of Members, the problem is evident. It is in this Assembly that we do approve and appropriate money that are supposed to be spent by this particular department. The money we are talking about in this case was appropriated by this Assembly. We must now ask where it has disappeared to. There is evidence that this particular cadre are being deducted Ksh500.00 monthly for NHIF. Where does the money go to if it is not being remitted to where it should so that it can help them? It is not our responsibility to cry to the executive. We have a job to do. On oversight, this is where we come in. The House must rise to the occasion and do its oversight role. We must know where this money is going. This initiative was in the Governor's Manifesto; CHVs were to be employed. The Governor did exactly that. Right now, there are some officers who are failing the Governor. The House should make it clear. From the report, I was stunned why the Labor Committee was terming this a Progressive Report and yet we are being told that tomorrow they will give a Comprehensive Report. This looks like a comprehensive report. If they were not sure whether this was a progressive report or a comprehensive report, then an Ad hoc Committee should be constituted to look into this matter in details. Let us put our feet together and help the Governor achieve his dream. Thank you.

**Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Hon Roy Samo.

**Hon. Samo:** Thank you Mr. Speaker for giving me this chance to contribute on this wonderful motion. The Hon. Chair for Labor – Hon. Rashid is a very competent person and what he has presented here as progress report captures the spirit of what is happening in the County. We have some officers who are not serious with their work in trying to help us fulfill our mandate. I want to concur with Hon. Seth Okumu who visited Gita which is now a County Hospital. Gita Sub-county Hospital is in Kajulu Ward. It should not even be called a County Hospital. It shouldn't even be called a Health Centre simply because you can't find the required services. I have been to Gita severally. The Casual Workers as it has been indicated have not been paid for quite a long time. The last time I visited that facility, they had not been paid for eight months. So you wonder how they work or even assist their families.

Mr. Speaker, Hon. Pete Oiko was very right in seeking this Statement. I concur with my colleagues who have contributed that the Health and the Finance Departments be summoned by the House for this matter to be addressed once and for all. You find that a County Hospital like Gita Sub-county Hospital, in between 5:00 pm or 6:00 pm, it is closed because it has only one nurse. There is not a single doctor in a County Hospital. But now the Community Health Volunteers who should be helping them have not been paid for a long time. So there is a big problem in most of the Health Facilities in the County. As an Assembly, we must rise up to the occasion and address the situation. If possible, we need to summon officers in the Health Department. There is no way an officer in the Department cannot account for the stipends paid to the CHVs. At first we were told they were being paid Kshs 4,000.00. I attended the Kisumu County Health forum that was held in Obuolo Grounds last year. At the forum, it was declared they were being paid Kshs 4,000.00. Now it is coming out that it is Kshs 2,500.00 but even with that, the amount is not being remitted to them. What are we doing as legislators? We are now demanding that both the Health and Finance Departments be summoned so that we can find a long lasting solution to the problem. Otherwise I support the interim report as we wait for the final report so that we can deliberate and make a decision. Thank you very much.

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Yes Hon. Maurice Ngeta of Awasi, MCA, Onjiko Ward.

**Hon. Ngeta:** Thank you Mr. Speaker...

**Hon. Seth:** Point of Order Mr. Speaker?

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): What is it Hon. Seth? Hon. Ngeta, Hon. Seth is on a Point of Order.

**Hon. Seth:** (On a Point of Order). Thank you Mr. Speaker. I just wanted to inform you that Hon. Ngeta is not properly dressed in the House and not fit to contribute here, thank you.

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Sergeant- at- arms will assist Hon. Ngeta but in the meantime Hon. Ameso the floor is yours.

**Hon. Ameso:** Thank you Mr. Speaker. It is quiet unfortunate when we learn how our good and young mothers in their effort to serve this County are being treated. We are all aware of the Governor's Manifesto on how to look into matters regarding Health in this County. This report is a true evidence the two Departments of Health and Finance has something which needs to be looked into. In many occasions those two Departments have been called before the floor of this House to answer various questions moreso related to this but in those occasions, the responses were the same.

Mr. Speaker, you are aware that in the same Department of Health we have been having challenges and issues with Human Resource. This is a Department that cannot even give a report of the list of how many Casuals they have in this County of Kisumu. This tells you that the team at the Department are much interested in earning salaries but not service delivery Mr. Speaker. That is why I wish that through your wisdom, if it is possible, the two Departments should be summoned and a serious action to be taken because they are letting down our Governor.

The Governor is so passionate about the plight of Health Workers to the extent that he gave an order stating that at least they be given a small stipend, but they are not receiving that money. A more saddening issue is that even the statutory deductions are not being remitted.

Mr. Speaker, I am a member of the Health Committee and we have struggled to put the department on toes so as to furnish us with this report but they have failed Mr. Speaker. I want to plead with you as the Chairperson that through your wisdom, something needs to be done, even if we are still waiting for the report from them, which I still believe that they won't give it out. This statement was not raised yesterday and has been with them for a decade yet they are still struggling to get the answers. Thank you.

**Hon. Ngeta:** Thank you Mr. Speaker... which our Health Workers are being mistreated in this County. It is only the Department of Health that is tarnishing the name of this County of Kisumu. It is well known across the World that the County Assembly of Kisumu has issues within the Department of Health and yet the staff of that department are not competent. Mr. Speaker, I plead with you and the entire House to take a drastic action. Otherwise thank you and I rest my case.

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Hon. Oiko, can I give Hon. Ngeta first then you take the second chance?

**Leader of Minority** (Hon. Oiko): Much oblige.

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): It is okay. Hon. Ngeta your microphone is okay; just add the volume and you proceed.

**Hon. Ngeta:** Thank you Mr. Speaker, I have added the volume to the top. First, I thank you Mr. Speaker and I want to concur with my colleague who has just spoken. This is one of the key

departments in this County Mr. Speaker. In our mandate, it is clearly indicated that this is one of the key roles that we are supposed to play safely. As the legislatures of this great County of Kisumu, we need to make these Health Volunteers who are happily working on their mandate.

Being a Health Volunteer is not an easy duty and I have witnessed so many cases while I was in the rural areas. This is a key department since health starts from the grassroots and we need to work on this department. I want to urge you Mr. Speaker to call upon the three main Committees; Health, Finance and General Oversight, so that we can have one meeting to determine where the mistakes are since this thing is going out of our hand, and may haunt us later. We want to be very vibrant with this department by working extra ordinarily hard in making sure that this department elevates. We really need to know where the problem is.

We are all aware of how the Governor of Kisumu County has tried to make this department modern and a role model to other departments, but it has not borne fruits. So we need to know where the problem is and come up with some proposals to enable this department to be atleast be a point of comparison to other departments, thank you.

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Hon. Genga.

**Hon. Genga:** *(Via Zoom)*. Yes Hon. Speaker can you hear me?

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Yes, proceed

**Hon. Genga:** Mr. Speaker, as it has already been confirmed by my colleagues...very key and it goes down...in fact I want to share with the House most of the time especially from my Ward (Koru)

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): You are not very clear, Hon. Genga

**Hon. Genga:** *(Via Zoom)*. I do not know why today the network is not very good. Nevertheless, I am saying...

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Yes

**Hon. Genga:** *(Via Zoom)*. Hon. Speaker can you hear me?

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Yes, Hon. Genga proceed.

**Hon. Genga:** *(Via Zoom)*. Hello, Hello. Hon. Speaker!!

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Proceed, we can hear you.

**Hon. Genga:** *(Via Zoom)*. Hello, Hello!

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): It looks like he has another problem. Yes Hon. Gard...It looks like he also has a problem with the audio. Yes Hon. Pete Oiko. Hon. Gard.

**Hon. Gard:** Mr. Speaker can you hear me?

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Yes proceed

**Hon. Gard:** *(Via Zoom)*. Thank you Mr. Speaker. I want to say that the Committee of Labour and Social Welfare Services should complete their job. Because when we talk about the issue of Community Health Workers, it goes in tandem with both Health and Labour and Social Welfare Services Committees. So as a senior...(inaudible)

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Hon. Gard it looks like ...

**Hon. Gard:** I think we should do a report so that we get to the bottom of this issue. I do not think that the Community Health Workers are going to do a good job if they are not taken care of. We have put a lot of money on the same but I am not seeing this money being used according to plan. Therefore Hon. Speaker I want to concur with Hon. Priscah Misachi.

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Hon. Gard I think we cannot get you very clear but it looks like you are supporting the sentiments of other members. So, I will just disconnect you because we cannot get you clearly.

**Hon. Gard:** *(Via Zoom)*. Hon. Speaker that is very true because you told me that the network is not very clear but....

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Yes, but we can hear that you are supporting the sentiments of other members.

**Hon. Gard:** *(Via Zoom)*. Hello

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Hon. Gard, it is okay since we have heard what you are saying. Hon. Benny Pete Oiko, Hon. Members I think he has a problem with the network that is why we cannot hear him properly, it is a hitch that we can sort out.

**Leader of Minority** (Hon. Pete): Thank you Mr. Speaker for giving me chance to air my views on the progress report by Labour and Social Welfare Services Committee. I want to remind members of this House that early last year, every elected member was given a list of Nyamruerus from his/her Ward to go and verify if the list was authentic. Members you owe these people an answer. The list was given to us to and verify....

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Hon. Olima, but we can hear that you are supporting the sentiments of other Hon. Members.

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Yes Hon. Pete.

**Hon. Pete:** Thank you Mr. Speaker for giving me the opportunity to contribute on the progress report by Committee of Labour. I want to remind Members of this House that early last year every elected Member was given a list of CHVs in his/her ward to go and verify if the list was authentic. I would like to say to the Members of this House that you owe this people an answer. That was an indication to them that we would answer on what happens to them at the end of the day. In the FY 2019/2020 their wages/stipend was factored in the Budget. They were very happy that we were concerned about their welfare. I would like to remind you that by the time that we came into office they had been promised some stipend that is Kshs. 2,500.00. If you go to the Budget of FY 2017/2018 you will find a figure of Kshs 75 million which none of them received and they were dreaming that we would look into their welfare.

Mr. Speaker, when the list was given to the Hon. Members to go and authenticate the names of the Members in their wards they were still lied to. What is happening now after that had been done; they were paid for some three months thereafter the payment stopped. We are aware of how they had been agitating for this matter on the ground. So that is why I raised this statement. At one time they confronted me in my ward and it was not only my ward but also Ahero Ward since we are neighbors and wanted to know if the County Assembly was aware that they were not receiving their wages. I told them that we were not aware because it had been factored in their Budget and they ought to have received their money.

They lamented that was not forth coming and we need to address that issue. They were just been promised, their leaders had taken up the matter with the office and no answer was forth coming. On 9<sup>th</sup> April this year the statement was raised in this House and the Speaker ordered that response was to be given on 29<sup>th</sup> April 2020 immediately after the recess but that was not forth coming. If you can look at the response of the department they responded on 21<sup>st</sup> July 2020 and when they responded on that date, the response was partial. Today we are on 19<sup>th</sup> August 2020 and they have still not fully responded. This are records which are with the department. What picture is being portrayed? They have taken the Assembly for granted, they don't value the services they should offer to the CHVs and if the money has not been paid when the last financial year ended on 30<sup>th</sup> June then I put to them a question and ask where the money has gone to?

Mr. Speaker, the County Assembly needs to assert its authority on the Health Department and Finance Department so that we can be taken as a serious lot. Mr. Speaker, when you look at the response given by the Chief Officer of Health and Sanitation, he is telling us that by the time the response was brought the CHVs had not been paid for three months and that they were going to pay this by end of June. Today is 19<sup>th</sup> August and no response is coming that they have been paid. The NHIF has not been paid and these are people who can fall sick any time as they attend to medical issues on the ground. A health worker whose employer does not take care of him/her and is expected to take care of the community is not able to work satisfactorily. The Casual Health workers in the facilities: These ones are there. The department has not bothered to pay



them and the financial year has ended. They can also not give the full record of these people as per the Health facilities. What does it mean? The officers are concerned with their welfare and not the welfare of the junior staff. Mr. Speaker I am asking that you order the Health and the Department of Finance to be taken to task to explain to Kisumu County why they handled these our brothers and sisters the way they have been doing. Members have suggested that the Labour, Health and the Finance committee to come together and the way I am seeing is that we will be forming a very big committee. If an Ad-hoc Committee is constituted straight away and we summon the Chief Officer for Health, Chief Officer for Finance and their CECs to come and give answers on why they are behaving on how they are. Otherwise, we owe as an Assembly an explanation to the community workers in Kisumu County. Thank you.

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Thank you Members. I did give time for Members to comment on the progress report by Hon. Miruka on behalf of the Labour Committee. I know that matter is very weighty and going by the sentiments of the Members, it is evident that this matter is as urgent and should have reached the Assembly by yesterday. I want to ask for the indulgence of the Assembly that the Chairperson of Labour Committee has indicated that he is going to receive a Comprehensive Report tomorrow. By your indulgence let us allow the committee to get the report and Hon. Miruka, I will give you the chance in the next sitting to present that report failure to which I will go by the sentiments of the Members that we shall form another committee that comprises of the three committees that have been mentioned that are Health Committee, Finance Committee and Labour Committee. In the meantime let us give him time; if he gets the report early in the morning then, we will allow him to present it in the afternoon or in the next sitting failure to which we will form another committee and we will give direction.

Hon. Miruka, kindly ensure that you get the Hansard Report for today for attachment to the letter that you will be sending to the Executive.

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): Next Order!

#### ADJOURNMENT

**The Speaker** (Hon. Oraro): There being no any other business to transact, the House stands adjourned to tomorrow, Thursday 20<sup>th</sup> August 2020 at 2.30 p.m.

*(House rose at 3.42 p.m.)*

**Addendum**

*Zablon Otiende – Head of Department*

*Edward Odanga – Hansard Reporter*

*Fanuel Okode – Hansard Reporter*

*Patrick Okoyo – Hansard Reporter*

*Jacklyne Otieno – Hansard Reporter*

*Denis Onyango – Hansard Reporter*

*Jesca Otieno – Hansard Reporter*