

COUNTY GOVERNMENT OF KISUMU



COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KISUMU

THE HANSARD

Official Report

THIRD ASSEMBLY – THIRD SESSION

Wednesday, 11th September, 2024

House met in the Main Chamber at 09:00 a.m.

(The Speaker (Hon. Elisha Jack Oraro) in the Chair)

PRAYERS

The Speaker (Hon. Oraro): Honourable Members, I refer you to the provisions of Order No. 32 (2) of the Kisumu County Assembly Standing Order on the quorum before the commencement of business. I direct that, the quorum bell be rung for the first five minutes. Consequently, Members are not allowed to go out until a determination is made whether we have quorum or no.

(Quorum bell rung for the first five minutes)

The Speaker (Hon. Oraro): The Honourable Whip, can you please confirm if we have quorum.

The Deputy Whip (Hon. Obonyo, MCA, South West Kisumu): Thank you Mr. Speaker, we have quorum. Thank you.

The Speaker (Hon. Oraro): Mr. Clerk, please take us through the order of the day?

The Speaker (Hon. Oraro): Next order!!

COMMUNICATION FROM THE CHAIR

The Speaker (Hon. Oraro): Honourable Members, I have two communications to make. One, this is a reminder that today after the afternoon session, all the Members of the Select Committee on Appointments are requested to attend a special sitting in committee room one for the purposes of preparations for the vetting exercise to be conducted tomorrow of the following proposed nominees;

- a) Proposed nominee for the position of County Executive Committee Member for Water, Environment and Natural Resources and Climate Change, and
- b) Proposed nominee for the position of City Board to represent Professional Groups.

Honourable Members, I have consulted and found out that a number of Members of this Select House Committee are out on official duties. So, at this juncture, we resolved to co-opt the following Chairpersons to the Select Committee on Appointments for the vetting exercise;

- a) Chairperson, Water, Environment and Natural Resources and Climate Change
- b) Chairperson, Lands, Physical Planning and Urban Development

Honourable Members, on the same note, the scheduled General Oversight Committee is postponed to Thursday, 19th September, 2024 at 11:00 a.m. So, kindly appraise yourself with the concerns and those Members with additional queries can submit them to the clerk of this House Committee.

Honourable Members, lastly, on the 03rd of September, 2024 we received a letter from the Department of Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries inviting all Honourable Members of the County Assembly of Kisumu for a Sensitization Workshop on the Implementations of the Status of Donor Funded Project National Agriculture Value Chain Development (NAVCDP). This workshop is scheduled to take place on the 13th and 14th September, 2024 at the Sarova Woodlands Hotel in Nakuru County. Members are therefore requested to travel to Nakuru if possible tomorrow in the evening. Again, this is to further inform you that there will be facilitation by the partner. So, please organize for your accommodation because your daily subsistence allowance will be disbursed thereafter.

On the same note, I request all Honourable Members to see Hon. Eunice Alando, who is the Chairperson, Standing Committee on Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries for the purposes of confirmation of your attendance. There is a list that is in circulation that you will be obligated to sign to confirm your attendance and again there is another list that will be used to verify the same while in Nakuru. So, at your convenient time in the course of the day make an effort to see Hon. Alando, the Chairperson, Standing Committee on Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries. Otherwise, I wish you well as we proceed with this session.

The Speaker (Hon. Oraro): Next order!!

PAPERS LAID

THE KISUMU COUNTY ANNUAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN (KCADP) FOR THE FY
2025/2026

REPORTS OF THE OFFICE OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL ON MIGOSI SUB-COUNTY
HOSPITAL FOR THE YEAR ENDED 30TH JUNE, 2022 AND 30TH JUNE, 2023

THE KISUMU COUNTY DRAFT FINANCE BILL, 2024

BY

HON. KEN OOKO, MCA, AHERO

(LEADER OF MAJORITY)

The Speaker (Hon. Oraro): Honourable Leader of Majority.

Leader of Majority (Hon. Ooko, MCA, Ahero): Thank you Mr. Speaker, I wish to lay the following papers.

1. Pursuant to the provisions of section 6 (3) of the Public Finance Management Act, 2012, I wish to table today Wednesday, 11th September, 2024 the Kisumu County Annual Development Plan (KCADP) for the FY 2025/2026
2. Pursuant to the provisions of section 32 of the of the Public Finance Management Act, 2012, I wish to table today Wednesday, 11th September, 2024 Reports of the Office of the Auditor General on Migosi Sub-county Hospital for the year ended 30th June, 2022 and
3. Pursuant to the provisions of section 32 of the of the Public Finance Management Act, 2012, I wish to table today Wednesday, 11th September, 2024 Reports of the Office of the Auditor General on Migosi Sub-county Hospital for the year ended 30th June, 2023
4. Pursuant to the provisions of section 131 and 132 of the Public Finance Management Act, 2012, I wish to table today Wednesday, 11th September, 2024 the Kisumu County Draft Finance Bill, 2024.

Thank you.

(The Leader of Majority lays the reports before the House for consideration)

The Speaker (Hon. Oraro): Honourable Members, I confirm that the four documents have been properly laid before this House that is;

1. Kisumu County Annual Development Plan (KCADP) for the FY 2025/2026
2. Reports of the Office of the Auditor General on Migosi Sub-county Hospital for the year ended 30th June, 2022 and

3. Reports of the Office of the Auditor General on Migosi Sub-county Hospital for the year 30th June, 2023
4. The Kisumu County Draft Finance Bill, 2024

Honourable Members, I direct as follows;

1. Reports of the Office of the Auditor General on Migosi Sub-county Hospital for the year ended 30th June, 2022 and Reports of the Office of the Auditor General on Migosi Sub-county Hospital for the year 30th June, 2023 be committed to the Select Committee of PIC/PAC

Honourable Members, I am aware that this House Committee has a lot of pending reports. I want to advice this House Committee that, because you are seven in number you can form two teams and liaise with the Clerk to communicate to the Office of the Auditor General to assist by adding you more personnel so that you are able to fast-track on the pending works.

2. The Kisumu County Annual Development for the FY 2025/2026 and the Draft Kisumu County Finance Bill, 2024. I commit these two reports to the Select Committee of Budget and Appropriations.

Honourable Members, I want to remind you that, as you are aware that, the Budget Making Process has laid down the processing frameworks. As per these frameworks the Finance Bill should be approved 90 days after approval of the Appropriations Bill and that is by 01st of October. So, I want to urge the relevant House Committee to accord priority to the Kisumu County Finance Bill, 2024 alongside the Kisumu County Annual Development Plan for the FY 2025/2026. The Finance Bill is key.

The County Executive had conducted their Public Participation and this House Committee knows what is supposed to be done when such documents are tabled in the House. Honourable Members, I am aware that the Chairperson, Select Committee of Budget and Appropriation is out on official duties but the Members of that House Committee who are here in this House please, convey the same and the Clerk please prioritize this so that the Kisumu County Finance Bill, 2024 is dealt with as appropriate. Thank you.

The Speaker (Hon. Oraro): Next order!!

MOTION

SLECT COMMITTEE ON IMPLEMENTATION REPORT ON THE IMPLEMENTATION
STATUS OF PROJECTS APPROVED IN THE FY 2022/2023

BY

HON HENRIETTA BODO, NOMINATED MEMBER

The Speaker (Hon Oraro): Hon Henrietta Bodo informed me that Hon Were would Move the Motion on her behalf. I can see Hon Were already on his feet.

Hon Were (MCA, Nyalenda “B”): Thank you Mr. Speaker. I rise to Move Motion on Implementation Status of Projects Approved in the FY 2022/2023.

Mr. Speaker and Honourable Members, the Select Committee on Implementation is mandated to scrutinize the resolutions of the County Assembly (including adopted Committee reports), Statements, Petitions and the undertakings given by the County Executive Committee and examine whether or not such decisions and undertakings have been implemented within sixty (60) days.

On 13th March, 2024, a statement was raised on the floor of this Honorable House Pursuant to Standing Orders No.41(2)(b) by Hon. Oiko Pete MCA, representing Kabonyo Kanyagwal on the matter of Implementation status of projects approved in the Fiscal Year 2022/2023. The statement was subsequently committed to the Select Committee on Implementation for inquiry and reporting pursuant to Standing Orders No.184 of the Kisumu County Assembly Standing Orders.

The Select Committee on Implementation at its meeting held on 19th March, 2024 sought to consider the statement by Hon. Oiko Pete during which it resolved that all the relevant department to furnish it with a detailed response on the issues as heightened on the statement.

Consequently, the Committee at its meeting held on 6th May, 2024 scrutinized the responses received on the issues highlighted on the statement and further resolved to conduct a site visit which took place between 26th July to 5th August, 2024.

This comprehensive report therefore is a compilation of the responses received from Executive and information gathered from site visit on the approved projects during the FY 2022/2023.

Establishment and Mandate of the Committee

Mr. Speaker and Honourable Members, the Select Committee on Implementation is established Pursuant to the provisions of Standing Orders No. 191 of the County Assembly of Kisumu.

Mr. Speaker and Honourable Members, the Committee is mandated to scrutinize the resolutions of the County Assembly (including adopted Committee reports), Petitions and the undertakings given by the County Executive Committee and examine whether or not such decisions and undertakings have been implemented, where implemented, the extent to which they have been implemented; and whether such implementation has taken place within the minimum time necessary; and whether or not legislation passed by the County Assembly has been operationalized and where operationalized, the extent to which such operationalization has taken place within the minimum time necessary. The Committee may also propose to the County Assembly, sanctions against any member of the County Executive Committee who fails to report

to the relevant select Committee on implementation status of projects and programs under his or her docket without justifiable reasons.

Mr. Speaker and Honourable Members, Standing Order No.184 further provides that Within six days of a resolution of the County Assembly or adoption of a report of a select committee, the relevant member of the County Executive under whose portfolio the implementation of the resolution falls shall provide a report to the relevant committee of the County Assembly in Accordance with article 153(4) (b) of the Constitution.

Composition of the Committee

Mr. Speaker and Honourable Members, the Committee as currently constituted comprises of the following Honorable Members,

Table 1: Committee Membership as at April, 2024.

S/NO	NAME	POSITION
1.	Hon. Henrietta Bodo	Chairperson
2.	Hon. James Were	Vice Chairperson
3.	Hon. Anne Ochola	Member
4.	Hon. Geoffrey Warindo	Member
5.	Hon. Boitone Ratib	Member
6.	Hon. Mickey Awuor	Member
7.	Hon. Vincent Jagongo	Member
8.	Hon. Caroline Opar	Member
9.	Hon. Mildred Ajumbo	Member
	Secretariat	
1.	Pst. David Ochieng	Senior Clerk Assistant
2.	Ms. Grace Kung'a	Committee Clerk
3.	Mr. Rodgers Wagude	Clerk Assistant
4.	Mr. Wycliffe Owade	Research
5.	Mr. Fanuel Okode	Hansard Reporter
6.	Mr. Abraham Odegi	Sergeant-At-Arms

Acknowledgement

Mr. Speaker and Honourable Members, the Committee wishes to thank the offices of the Speaker and Clerk of the Assembly for the support and also for providing a conducive environment which enabled committee to carry out its mandates effectively.

I also want to appreciate the members of the Committee on Implementation for their dedication, commitment and valuable contribution exhibited during the scrutiny of the county assembly resolutions.

Finally, I wish to thank the Secretariat for their untiring commitment in ensuring that the Committee achieves its mandates.

Mr. Speaker Sir and Hon. Members, it is now my pleasant duty and honor, to table this report on the statement raised by Hon. Oiko Pete on the Implementation status of projects approved in the FY 2022/2023, for consideration and adoption.

Mr. Speaker and Honourable Members, on 13th March, 2024, a statement was raised on the floor of this Honorable House Pursuant to Standing Orders No.41 (2) (b) by Hon. Oiko Pete MCA, representing Kabonyo Kanyagwal on the matter of Implementation status of projects approved in the fiscal year 2022/2023. The statement was subsequently committed to the Select Committee on Implementation for inquiry and investigation pursuant to Standing Orders No.184 of the Kisumu County Assembly Standing Orders.

In the statement, the Committee on Implementation was requested to furnish this Honourable House with a report on the following;

- a) The total number of complete projects and programs executed by the executive under the ward based allocation during the fiscal year 2022/2023 in each department
- b) The total number of complete projects and programs executed by the executive under the flagship projects and departmental projects for the same period
- c) A detailed breakdown of the stalled and ongoing projects within the ward based projects/programmes and the flagship projects
- d) The specific ward or sub-county where the project is being implemented
- e) The approved budget allocation for each project
- f) The amount paid for each project
- g) Ongoing project the response should contain the current percentage of works done
- h) A clear way forward or strategy for any stalled or incomplete projects outlining the steps to be taken for their successful completion.

In considering the statement, the Committee first held its sitting on 19th March, 2024, during which it resolved that all the relevant departments to furnish it with a detailed response on the issues as heightened on the statement.

Subsequently, the Committee at its meeting held on 6th May, 2024, considered all the responses received from relevant departments of Executive and resolved to conduct site visit to validate over the same.

The Committee therefore, came up with a program of site which commenced from 26th July to 5th August. Below is the information gathered from projects visited as per the approved program developed by the Committee and approved by the Hon. Speaker.

Methodology used during the inquiry.

Mr. Speaker and Honourable Members, due to the magnitude of the work and the logistical challenges, the Committee relied on the following methods/tools to gather the information needed;

- a) Wrote letters to all the relevant CEC Members requesting them to furnish the Committee with a detailed response on the issues as highlighted on the statement
- b) Held consultative meetings with relevant officers from respective wards who could be reached including Ward Administrators and Sub-County Administrators
- c) Visited sampled projects in each and every ward as per the approved programme
- d) Interviews with stakeholders on sight
- e) Took photographs on certain projects
- f) Use of Observation
- g) Use of templates for MCAs to assess responses from the Executive

DETAILS OF IMPLEMENTATION STATUS OF ALL APPROVED WARD BASED PROJECTS FOR THE FISCAL YEAR 2022/2023.

NYANDO SUB-COUNTY

4. KABONYO/KANYAGWAL WARD.

DEPARTM ENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLO CATED AMOUNT	AMOU NT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPART MENT REMARK S	COMMITTEE OBSERVATIO N DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMENDAT ION
MEDICAL SERVICES, PUBLIC HEALTH AND SANITATI ON	Completi on of Kanyagwa l dispensary	1,500,000	1,498,4 42	100% Comple te	Ready for operationa lization	-Work incomplete -There was lack of consultation between the contractor and the technical personnel on BQs during the entire phase of the project -Incomplete electrification (wiring and other electrical outlets) and	-There is need for more clarification on the scope of work following emerging issues - The BQs should be shared with the users of the facility in a consultative and transparent manner - The department of public works should prioritize removal of the condemned

						partial wall painting - Report on condemned buildings was submitted to Public Works and still pending -Workers personally sourced locks, shelves and grill doors from their own pockets	buildings as they remain a health hazard
--	--	--	--	--	--	---	--

5. AWASI ONJIKO WARD.

DEPARTM ENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOUN T PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPARTM ENT REMARKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATIO N DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMEN DATION
WATER, ENVIRON MENT AND NATURAL RESOURC ES	Completion of Okiro bore hole water project	2,500,000		100% Complet e	Drilling complete but borehole dry	- Water drilled 1 year ago but non-functional with no feedback on status of the project to the stakeholders -No active project committee in place -Disagreement between the previous and current surveyor on exact location of water	-The water table identification conflict between the surveyors should be urgently addressed as it continues to hamper the progress of the project -The project should be completed to enable the children,

						table with two sites identified separately -Children and teachers have to source water outside the school, which is located some distance away	teachers and community access water - There is need for regular feedback to the school/community on the status of the project
--	--	--	--	--	--	---	--

6. KOBURA WARD.

DEPARTMENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOUNT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPARTMENT REMARKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION
TRADE, TOURISM, COOPERATIVES, INDUSTRY & MARKETING	Supply, Installation, Testing and Commissioning of one number 15M high mast floodlight at Kobura, Rabuor junction	2,000,000	1,999,810	100% Complete	Done	Work done according to scope of work	The quality standard of work should be maintained in future projects

7. AHERO WARD.

DEPARTMENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOUNT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPARTMENT REMARKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION
WATER, ENVIRONMENT AND	Embankment Kadhiambo/Kowito	2,300,000	2,300,000	100% complete	Done	- Work was successfully completed in accordance with	-There is need for a sustainable intervention

NATURAL RESOURCES	stream					the scope of work - Key challenge is perennial flooding	through periodic funding disbursement for embankment reinforcement and regular maintenance and inspection as a long-term solution
-------------------	--------	--	--	--	--	---	---

8. EAST KANO /WAWIDHI WARD

DEPARTMENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOUNT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPARTMENT REMARKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION
MEDICAL SERVICES, PUBLIC HEALTH AND SANITATION	Fencing and putting Pit Latrine at Ogango Health Centre	2,000,000	2,000,000	100% Complete	Ready for operationalization	- The pit latrine and fence was successfully completed in accordance with the scope of work - Key Challenges include perennial flood and access road to the facility - The facility is starting to dilapidate with signs of crumbling walls and deteriorating	-Urgent measures are needed during the subsequent budget to renovate the facility to prevent further cost implications - Access road should be urgently addressed as it is crucial to the facilities' functionality and accessibility

						floors	
--	--	--	--	--	--	--------	--

KISUMU CENTRAL SUB-COUNTY

9. RAILWAYS WARD

DEPARTM ENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOUN T PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPART MENT REMARK S	COMMITTEE OBSERVATIO N DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMEN DATION
EDUCATI ON, HUMAN RESOURC E DEVELOP MENT AND ICT	Completion of Kudho ECDE	1,300,000	1,298,82 8	100% Complete	Complete	-Completion done but delayed to FY 2023/2024 due to contractor issues	-Going forward priority should be given to pit latrine for the ECD pupils, additional staffing, water catchment facilities (tank and gutters)

10. KONDELE WARD

DEPARTM ENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOUN T PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPART MENT REMARK S	COMMITTEE OBSERVATIO N DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMEN DATION
MEDICAL SERVICES, PUBLIC HEALTH AND SANITATI ON	Constructio n of Kosawo dispensary	10,000,00 0	1,298,82 8	67%	The project temporari ly stalled due to lack of payment of previous certificate	- The work was completed in accordance with the scope of work	-Subsequent budget should prioritize completion of the project given its wide catchment area

					raised		
--	--	--	--	--	--------	--	--

11. MARKET MILIMANI WARD

DEPARTMENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOUN T PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPART MENT REMARK S	COMMITTEE OBSERVATIO N DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMEN DATION
PUBLIC SERVICE, COUNTY ADMINISTRATION & PARTICIP ATORY DEVELOP MENT	Constructio n of Governors residence	42,500,00 0	22,000,0 00	75% complete	Ongoing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Main house 90% complete - Solutions being sort after the Governor's security was questioned following the surrounding premise - Money utilized properly 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Urgent measures should be taken to enhance security of the Governor's residence and the environs

SEME SUB-COUNTY

12. NORTH SEME

DEPARTMENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOUN T PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPART MENT REMARK S	COMMITTEE OBSERVATIO N DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMEN DATION
WATER, ENVIRON MENT AND NATURAL RESOURC ES	Solarizing of St.Barnabas Secondary School Water Project	2,000,000		100% complete	Functional	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Not functional - School financed the stand for the solar panels - Shortage of 	-An immediate investigation be launched on why the project is non-functional and yet complete

						water with school depending on the neighbor's borehole	
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

13. WEST SEME WARD.

DEPARTM ENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOUN T PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPA RTME NT REMA RKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMEND ATION
WATER, ENVIRON MENT AND NATURAL RESOURC ES	Drilling and equipping of borehole at Ngere.(Re located to Kitare)	3,000,000		95 %comp lete	At the final stage of testing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Functional - Not handed over officially by the county - Drilling of the borehole in FY 2022/2023 - Equipping of the borehole FY2023/2024 - Need for relocation of solar panels from the current location due to security concerns - Some community members are using water for their own selfish gain 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The contractor should officially hand over the facility for use - Issue of security for the solar panels should be addressed as a matter of urgency - Going forward an affordable fee be charged for sustainable maintenance of the

							project
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	---------

14. EAST SEME

DEPARTM ENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOUN T PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPART MENT REMARK S	COMMITTEE OBSERVATIO N DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMEN DATION
MEDICAL SERVICES, PUBLIC HEALTH AND SANITATI ON	Completion of maternity wing Miranga Sub-County Hospital	2,000,000	1,998,92 4	100% Complete	Already operating	- The project was completed in accordance with the scope of work - Facility operational with transparent roofing, maternity ward, painting, plumbing, sewerage system, labor ward tiling and laundry area	- In the subsequent budgeting, priority be given to equipping of the facility - The quality standards of work should be maintained in future projects

15. CENTRAL SEME

DEPART MENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOC ATED AMOUN T	AMOU NT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPA RTME NT REMA RKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIO N

WATER, ENVIRO NMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES	Osio-Ajulu Water Point-Piping and Solar Installation	1,000,000		100% complete	Borehole Solarized and functional	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Project functional - 3 vandalism attempts - Tank kept by a neighbor to the project due to insecurity - The ground/foundation to be raised before placing the tank and solar panels to prevent easy access 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Issue of security for the project should be comprehensively addressed through joint efforts of project committee/county government and local security agencies in the area
---	--	-----------	--	---------------	-----------------------------------	--	--

KISUMU WEST SUB-COUNTY

16. CENTRAL KISUMU WARD

DEPARTMENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOUNT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPARTMENT REMARKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION
AGRICULTURE, IRRIGATION, LIVESTOCK & FISHERIES	Supply and delivery of Hybrid Lays Day Old Chicks	2,000,000	1,640,000		Hybrid Lays day old Chicks Supplied	Hybrid Lays day old Chicks successfully supplied	This quality of work should be maintained in future

17. SOUTH WEST KISUMU WARD

DEPARTMENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOUNT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPARTMENT REMARKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION
MEDICAL SERVICES, PUBLIC	Completion of Ongalo Dispensary	1,500,000	1,499,500	100% Complete	Complete and ready for	- Currently operational with	- Electricity meter should be under the

HEALTH AND SANITATION					operation alization	renovated floor, maternity room and installation of electricity and water tank - Electricity meter under individual name;	name of the facility - In future challenges such as understaffing and late payment of staff should be addressed within the subsequent financial years
-----------------------	--	--	--	--	---------------------	--	--

18. WEST KISUMU WARD

DEPARTMENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOUNT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPARTMENT REMARKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION
EDUCATION, HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT AND ICT	Construction of Maliera ECDE	1,700,000	1,700,000	100% Complete	Complete	Work done according to the scope of work	The quality standard of work should be maintained in future projects

19. NORTH WEST KISUMU WARD

DEPARTMENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	PAYMENT STATUS	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPARTMENT REMARKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION
------------	---------------------	-------------------	----------------	--------------------	--------------------	---	--------------------------

WATER, ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES	Construction of 30,000 litres Water Tank at Esivalu	2,300,000	complete	100% Complete	Functional	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Not in use - Not up to the standards 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - There is need for more clarification on the scope of work following poor workmanship - An urgent investigation be done on why it is non-functional with the department confirming it operational
--	---	-----------	----------	---------------	------------	---	---

20. NORTH KISUMU WARD

DEPARTMENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCATED AMOUNT	AMOUNT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPARTMENT REMARKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION
EDUCATION, HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT AND ICT	Construction of Dago Thim ECDE	1,700,000	1,669,200	100% Complete	Complete	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - One classroom building in accordance with the scope of work - Poor workmanship 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - There is need for more clarification on the scope of work following poor workmanship - Going forward, subsequent budget allocations be considered to address various challenges facing the ECDE such as understaffing,

						based on incomplete wiring	provision of toilet, playground and water
--	--	--	--	--	--	----------------------------	---

KISUMU EAST SUB-COUNTY

21. MANYATTA B WARD

DEPARTMENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCATED AMOUNT	AMOUNT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPARTMENT REMARKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION
All the departments	No development Project	-	-				

22. KOLWA CENTRAL

DEPARTMENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCATED AMOUNT	AMOUNT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPARTMENT REMARKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION
WATER, ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES	Lakers Opuche to Auji (desiltation works)	2,000,000		100% Complete	Complete	Work successfully done	The quality standard of work should be maintained in future projects

23. KOLWA EAST

DEPARTMENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCATED AMOUNT	AMOUNT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPARTMENT REMARKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION
------------	---------------------	------------------	-------------	--------------------	--------------------	---	--------------------------

EDUCATION, HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT AND ICT	Completion of Anywang' 2 ECD Classrooms	2,800,000	2,791,860	100% Complete	Complete	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The work was completed in accordance with the scope of work - The ECD pit latrine is in pathetic state - The primary school administration has continued to provide conducive environment for enrolment and retention of the ECD learners 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Subsequent budget should prioritize construction of a user-friendly pit latrine for the ECD learners since it defines the school - An ECD signboard should be placed to indicate name of the project
---	---	-----------	-----------	---------------	----------	---	---

24. NYALENDA A

DEPARTMENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOUNT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPARTMENT REMARKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION
MEDICAL SERVICES, PUBLIC HEALTH AND SANITATION	Completion of Kowino Maternity Wing	4,000,000	3,999,923	100% Complete	Allocated 4M in the current financial year for structural completion	Project completed in accordance with the scope of work	The quality standard of work should be maintained in future projects

25. KAJULU WARD

DEPARTM ENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOU NT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPAR TMENT REMAR KS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMEN DATION
ENERGY, TRANSPOR T, ROADS AND PUBLIC WORKS	Completion of Guba – Kamonge Access Road	3,200,000	3,199,4 21	100% Complete	Done	Project completed in accordance with the scope of work	The quality standard of work should be maintained in future projects

MUHORONI SUB-COUNTY

26. CHEMELIL WARD

DEPARTM ENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOU NT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPAR TMENT REMAR KS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMEN DATION
MEDICAL SERVICES, PUBLIC HEALTH AND SANITATI ON	Ogen Dispensary Maternity Wing completion and Septic Tank	3,000,000	2,996,4 70	100% Complete	Ready for operation alization	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The maternity wing and septic tank satisfactorily completed in accordance with the scope of work - The showers have been installed but there is no water with pump yet to be purchased - Inadequate consultation between the contractor and the staff workers on 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Adequate and critical equipping, needs to be addressed in subsequent budget to make the facility fully functional - Need for inclusive involvement of technical personnel during the entire phase of

						<p>project design and implementation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The formal opening of the facility is taking too long with cost implications - The old health facility currently in use is extremely pathetic with sinking floors and walls crumbling raising safety concerns - No existing staff quarter 	<p>the project</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The new facility should be opened as a matter of urgency to prevent further dilapidation - The old health facility should be condemned as a matter of urgency since it poses a high risk
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

27. MASOGO NYANGOMA WARD

DEPARTMENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOUNT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPARTMENT REMARKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION
WATER, ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES	Completion of Orago water project	2,000,000		100% Complete	Borehole drilled and capped	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Project is incomplete - No feedback to the school/community on the project status - The tank and 	<p>The project should be completed to allow the users access water</p> <p>-Need for strengthened collaboration between the</p>

						pipe yet to be purchased causing school children and teachers to suffer due to long distance in search of water	department/contractor and the stakeholders during the entire project cycle - The department should give regular feedback to project users on status of the project
--	--	--	--	--	--	---	---

28. MIWANI WARD

DEPARTMENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCATED AMOUNT	AMOUNT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPARTMENT REMARKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION
EDUCATION, HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT AND ICT	Completion of Olasi ECDE Classrooms	1,200,000	1,198,740	0% Complete	Awarded but no work done	-The work remains incomplete despite the money disbursed - Construction challenges include; classroom doors/windows, tiling, chairs and partitioning) - Lack of pit latrine as learners use	- Further investigation is needed to determine why Ksh 1,200,000.00 disbursed for a project that was not completed. - The CEC /contractor should be summoned for more information - Investigative agencies should be asked to

						<p>the same building for toilet-use with teachers responsible for daily cleaning</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Teachers yet to be posted by the department - Lack of communication with stakeholders on the phase of the project 	<p>urgently probe this matter</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - There is need for frequent engagement with the stakeholders on progress of the project - Relevant departments including education/health and environment should be instructed to probe the issue of ECDE pit latrine and necessary action taken as a matter of urgency
--	--	--	--	--	--	---	---

29. OMBEYI WARD

DEPARTMENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOUNT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPARTMENT REMARKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION
MEDICAL SERVICES, PUBLIC HEALTH AND SANITATION	Completion of Ramula Male Ward	2,000,000	1,997,288			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Completion of the work not satisfactory - Painting, tiling and water piping have been completed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The quality of work is below standard and scope of work should be reviewed - There should

						<p>- Challenges include inadequate staffing, vandalism of water taps, lack of fencing, and the absence of a power connection within MCH/MPH building</p>	<p>be regular feedback to project stakeholders on status of the project</p> <p>- Priority should be given to addressing the deteriorating situation of the facility including bats infestation, hand washing point, cracked walls and the underutilized spaces</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

30. MUHORONI/ KORU WARD

DEPARTMENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOU NT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPARTME NT REMARKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVAT ION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMEN DATION
MEDICAL SERVICES, PUBLIC HEALTH AND SANITATION	Electrical work and equipping koru dispensary	3,000,000	2,999,900	100% Complete	Another allocation of ksh. 3,000,000 was done in the current financial year	Project completed in accordance with the scope of work	The quality standard of work should be maintained in future projects

					and the contractors is on site		
--	--	--	--	--	--------------------------------	--	--

NYAKACH SUB-COUNTY

31. WEST NYAKACH WARD

DEPARTM ENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOU NT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPAR TMENT REMAR KS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMEN DATION
MEDICAL SERVICES, PUBLIC HEALTH AND SANITATI ON	Completion of Kodingo/Ku sa Health Centre	1,200,000	1,198,6 70	100% complete	The project complete	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The project was completed in accordance with the scope of work - Project inputs included; Floor tiling, fixing of window glasses - Painting and decoration of wall, windows and doors - Doors not painted 	- The quality standards of work should be maintained in future projects

32. NORTH NYAKACH WARD

DEPARTM ENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOU NT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPA RTME NT REMA RKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMEN DATION
----------------	---------------------------	-------------------------	--------------------	--------------------------	-----------------------------------	--	---------------------------------

MEDICAL SERVICES, PUBLIC HEALTH AND SANITATION	Completion and equipping of Michura Dispensary	2,500,000	2,445,384	100% complete	Ready for opening	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The project was completed in accordance with the scope of work - Project inputs included; <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Fencing Gate installation Digging of pit latrine Wiring of the facility 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The quality standards of work should be maintained in future projects
--	--	-----------	-----------	---------------	-------------------	---	---

33. CENTRAL NYAKACH WARD

DEPARTMENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOUNT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPARTMENT REMARKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION
TRADE, TOURISM, COOPERATIVES, INDUSTRY & Marketing	Proposed completion of Pap Onditi Market	1,500,000	-		Contract terminated and rewarded. Works ongoing	<p>The Project was completed in accordance with the scope of work</p> <p>Project inputs included; <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Fencing and Gate installation </p>	The quality standard of work should be maintained in future projects

34. SOUTH WEST NYAKACH WARD

DEPARTMENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALLOCA TED AMOUNT	AMOUNT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPARTMENT REMARKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION
------------	---------------------	-------------------	-------------	--------------------	--------------------	---	--------------------------

ENERGY, TRANSPORT, ROADS AND PUBLIC WORKS	Completion of Radienya-Kodola Road	2,000,000	1,999,992	100% Complete	Complete	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The work was completed in accordance with the scope of work - Project inputs included; Culvert installation - Opening and Murraming 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The quality standards of work should be maintained in future projects
---	------------------------------------	-----------	-----------	---------------	----------	---	---

35. SOUTH EAST NYAKACH WARD

DEPARTMENT	NAME OF THE PROJECT	ALL OCATED AMOUNT	AMOUNT PAID	% OF THE WORK DONE	DEPARTMENT REMARKS	COMMITTEE OBSERVATION DURING SITE VISIT	COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION
ENERGY, TRANSPORT, ROADS AND PUBLIC WORKS	Completion of Nyamaroka-Pap Ndege Bodi Road	3,000,000	2,999,992	100% Complete		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The work was completed in accordance with the scope of work 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The quality standards of work should be maintained in future projects

Committee General Observations

- a) There are concerns across many of sites visited that key stakeholders are either rarely or insufficiently consulted regarding the scope of work outlined in the Bill of Quantities
- b) The provision of basic amenities such as water and pit latrines for ECD centers remains inadequate and inhumane as these essential needs are not considered during project initiation
- c) There is general laxity and detachment of some departmental officials from regular inspection of projects in respective wards

- d) There is a lack of initiative and responsibility among some community members in safeguarding their projects
- e) The offices of Public Participation and M&E domiciled within the Executive appear moribund in fast-tracking projects and giving updates
- f) The Committee of Implementation was unable to make comprehensive and informed decisions due to lack of experts in the diverse areas covered by the BQs. This can be largely attributed to insufficient funding.
- g) Completed projects take too long to be officially opened leading to deterioration, unnecessary additional costs and apathy from the citizens
- h) There are suspected cases of impropriety or negligence concerning some projects allocated in the budget and the funds disbursed for them.

Committee Recommendations

- a) That where there is proven negligence or misuse of public funds, particularly when money has been allocated and disbursed without an actual project in place, officers found culpable should be investigated and prosecuted in a court of law. The Committee on General Oversight formally requests that the Executive urgently engage investigative agencies to conduct these investigations. A report detailing the actions taken should be submitted to the House within 60 days
- b) That a formal request should be made to His Excellency the Governor, emphasizing the need and urgency for his officers to conduct regular inspections of projects with the utmost importance. This should include offices of Public Participation and Monitoring and Evaluation within the Executive. Furthermore, reports from all these offices should be submitted to this House for thorough examinations, followed by prompt actions
- c) That going forward, this House pass a resolution, emphasizing the need for sufficient budget allocation to enable all committees to effectively fulfill their oversight roles with a particular focus on regular site visits. This should include the engagement of experts in areas such as the interpretation and understanding of the BQs during these visits
- d) That this House pass a resolution requiring the contractors through the Executive to regularly consult with stakeholders on site, particularly technical personnel, throughout the entire project cycle. This ensures that they are fully involved in defining and understanding the scope of work within the Bill of Quantities
- e) That this House pass a resolution on writing a formal letter to the Executive urging them to prioritize the provision of basic amenities such as water and pit latrines for ECD learners during the initial stage of the project implementation
- f) That this House pass a resolution urging leaders within Kisumu County in general, to continuously take initiative in fostering patriotism among the public.

This will help safeguard projects in their respective wards, especially given the limited resources available

- g) That a formal letter be written to the Executive urging them to prioritize the formal opening of completed projects. This will help prevent dilapidation, the unnecessary wastage of public funds and public apathy.

Conclusion

Mr. Speaker and Honourable Members, it is now my honor and privilege, on behalf of the Committee on Implementation to move this motion before this Honorable House for Consideration and adoption. Madam Speaker, I would kindly request Senior Member of this committee, Hon Boitone Ratib, to second. Thank you.

(The Speaker vacates the chair, Hon. Carren Ajwang' Chairs)

The Temporary Speaker (Hon. Ajwang', MCA, Kaloleni/Shaurimoyo): Yes, Honourable Boitone Ratib.

Hon Boitone (MCA, Nyalenda "A"): Thank you Madam Speaker. I was still looking at the adoption schedules to check if I signed this document, but I believe I signed it because I've been participating on motion since its inception.

Madam Speaker, before I give my comment on the same, allow me to applaud the work of this House Committee. Madam Speaker, this House Committee, in its own wisdom, has made it very easy for Members of the committee also to participate actively in the activities of this House Committee. You realize yesterday, a Motion was moved by the Chair. Today, a Motion is being moved by the Vice-Chair. Tomorrow, a Motion from the same House Committee will be moved by Hon Boitone, and will be seconded by Hon Ajumbo. Madam Speaker this gives Members the urge and the morale to work as a team.

Madam Speaker, this report should be passed as soon as possible, because the recommendations that are given here, following the fact findings that this House Committee did on the site visits, are true to the letter. Madam Speaker, it is very unfortunate that in some projects, public funds were used and those projects never kicked off. It is my belief that officers who are concerned in these areas should be held responsible.

Madam Speaker, we need to set examples by maybe pushing forward for prosecution of these officers. It is pathetic that public funds are used and projects are not done in that respect. Madam Speaker, I also support the report because the Select Committee on on Implementation has come out very clear to do the oversight which is mandated by the Constitution.

Madam Speaker, it is our oversight authority and what we are doing now, at least we will put the County Executive on their toes as to offer the best service delivery to the citizens of Kisumu County. Madam Speaker, insufficient budget is also cutting across in most of these projects. This

is because we find projects are being allocated funds before the Bills of Quantities are developed. What comes out in such kind of situations? It is very clear. In most cases, the funds that are allocated are not in line with the specifications in the BQs.

Madam Speaker, this puts us in a very awkward situation because the contractors may not end up doing the scope of the work as per the BQs but will concentrate, given the allocations as per those projects. I like what the Department of Infrastructure is doing currently. Yesterday, we met and they are sending their team, they are sending their engineers to look at the scope of work in each and every Financial Year, so that when allocations is done, the allocations will be done in relation to the Bills of Quantities. That is quite encouraging and I encourage other departments to follow suit.

Madam Speaker, there are some areas where this House Committee found projects like in the construction of ECDE classrooms that are operating and there are no ablution blocks. This is quite pathetic. Madam Speaker, the County Government should wake up. And if need be, maybe we can put pressure so that these ECDEs be closed; because in the real sense, they are putting our children at risk. Imagine young boys and girls going to school where there is no ablution block. Madam Speaker, this is quite unfortunate, especially in this era.

Lastly, Madam Speaker, the recommendation number six, which is encouraging the community to take responsibility of these projects. This will be the best way of ensuring that these projects are taken care of. And if this kind of initiative is taken, then I believe that sustainability of these projects will be actually achieved. Madam Speaker, I wish to second. Thank you.

The Temporary Speaker (Hon. Ajwang', MCA, Kaloleni/Shaurimoyo): Honourable Members, now that a Motion on adoption of the report of the Select Committee on Implementation on the Implementation Status of Projects Approved in the Fiscal Year 2022/2023 has been presented by Hon Were and seconded by Hon Boitone.

Honourable Members, I propose a question that the Motion on adoption of the Report of the Implementation Committee on the Implementation Status of Projects Approved in the Fiscal Year 2022/2023 is now open for debate.

The Temporary Speaker (Hon. Carren, MCA, Kaloleni/Shaurimoyo): Yes, Honorable Kennedy Ouko

Hon Ouko (MCA, West Kisumu): Thank you Madam Speaker. Thank you very much. Foremost, may I take this opportunity to congratulate this House Committee for coming up with a very elaborate report. I also extend this to the Member who sought this through a Statement, Hon Oiko Pete. At least we have seen an expose'. There are a lot of things going around within the implementation of the projects, which are not exposed to the citizens and the House.

Madam Speaker, I want to be general by supporting the report. We have a problem with the Department of Monitoring and Evaluation. Madam Speaker, this department is seen by some other government agencies as an auditing department and as such it is feared. This is because these people do not understand the need and the importance of the Monitoring and Evaluation Department.

Madam Speaker, we are employing qualified personnel to do the monitoring and evaluation and this is a department which would actually give us the best measurement when the implementations are done and you know they are appearing nowhere. Surely Madam Speaker this is a department which should work very closely with the Select Committee on Implementation. It is my belief that we need to offer advise so that some of these officers may be transferred or retrained on what is expected of them. Madam Speaker, if this is not done, we will lose a lot of money. There's a lot of disconnect in the work of government agencies. The Department of Public Works just goes there and work on their own without considering probably the Department of Education and the Department of Budget which is in charge with disbursing funds who will just pay without contacting the Department of Public Works. There's a lot of disconnect and this is why we are failing to achieve on projects which are financed by the public coffers.

Madam Speaker, I don't know who to blame here. Is it the County Secretary? Is it the Minister in charge of Public Service and who should put things in order so that the whole agency works together for the benefit of the people? We are failing. Madam Speaker, when you find that there's a lot of vandalism of projects which are done by the government, it means the public is not fully involved even at the inception and at the handing over. Maybe they do it on their own without involving the people so that the people know they own the project and that the project is for the people. I believe that we need to work on this and I would request the Select Committee on Implementation to deliberately convene a meeting of all the implementing agencies concerned with these projects from the start of inception to the end result of handover. This will make the project be a collective responsibility to all the agencies which are concerned. If we don't do this, it is obvious that we'll continue experiencing loss of public fund, misuse of public funds, and a mis-priority in terms of projects to be done according to the demand of the people. Madam Speaker, I hereby support the report in full. Thank you.

The Temporary Speaker (Hon. Ajwang', MCA, Kaloleni/Shaurimoyo): Yes, Honourable Mildred Ajumbo.

Hon. Ajumbo (MCA, Central Seme): Thank you, Madam Speaker. I stand to support this report. I'm a member of the Select committee on Implementation and I want to confirm that this document is true. I want to just commend our Honorable MCA, Honorable Oiko Pete, for bringing up a statement on the matter of implementation status of the projects approved in the financial year 2022-2023. This House Committee went ahead to contact the department through

consultations, letter writing, and again this House Committee held interviews with key stakeholders on site. Madam Speaker, when we visited the site, there were quite a number of observations that were made. If you look at the observations, maybe I can just highlight on maybe one or two, that there are concerns that key stakeholders are either rarely or insufficiently consulted regarding the scope of work. In addition, there are certain amenities that are missing, like when we are putting up a project like the ECDEs classrooms where young children between ages of three to six learn. Madam Speaker, you can imagine putting up an ECDE block, where the block is completed, the children have no toilets, so they share toilets with the grown-ups. So, there was a concern and observation there.

Madam Speaker, this House Committee had several observations. On observation number five, the Office of Public Participation, Monitoring, and Evaluation is domiciled within the County Executive appear moribund in fast-tracking projects. When you look at the recommendation on the office that is dealing with monitoring and evaluation, just looking at the item where this House Committee has made a recommendation on item two. The committee's recommendation is that a formal request should be made to His Excellency the Governor, emphasizing the need and urgency for his officers to conduct regular inspections of projects with the utmost importance. This should include Office of the Public Participation and Monitoring and Evaluation within the Executive. Furthermore, reports from all these officers should be submitted to this House for examination. I want to agree with this House Committee, that this office that does monitoring and evaluation, immediately the projects are done, the said office of Monitoring and Evaluation, should go around inspecting projects. And when you look at some of these projects that are not completed, sometimes you wonder, because when you look at that, I don't have the attachment, but it is my belief that all of you have it, that you look at a project that was started, the project is 60% complete, yet there's a team that is called Monitoring and Evaluation.

So, sometimes you wonder, what does this team do? It is high time this Assembly, through the Committee of the Whole House, called the team that is called the Monitoring and Evaluation, to come and explain to the Assembly exactly what they did in the Financial year 2022-2023, so that the members can know exactly what this team does. Thank you, Madam Speaker, I support.

The Temporary Speaker (Hon. Carren Ajwang', MCA, Kaloleni/Shaurimoyo): Honourable Rakwach

Hon. Rakwach (MCA, Kolwa East): Thank you Madam Speaker. I also rise to give my comments on the report. First, I wish to appreciate the Honourable Member who came up with the statement that is Honourable Pete Oiko, which has enabled this House Committee to investigate and report back to the House. Secondly, I wish to thank the members of this House Committee for the work that they have done within a short time, and bringing every Member of the County Assembly on board, so that we know the status of implementation of these projects that they have aligned here.

Madam Speaker, I want to agree with the report that sometimes implementation is done, and we, the oversight team doesn't even know the extent of work, we don't know the scope of the work. I may want to implore on other Members of other Sectoral Committees, so that we put our departments to task, as we are already doing it in the Standing Committee of Infrastructure, Energy and Public Works,. We ensure that before the work commences on site, the BQs are developed on time, the blank BQs, so that we really know the scope of the work, so that at the end of the day, the contractor will not do some activities and leave out some other activities. I believe that this will makes it easier, even for a follow-up, when the Implementation committee now goes on the ground to look at whatever has been implemented, then they have where to make reference, whether the implementation is 100% or some activities were left out.

Madam Speaker, I have also seen a recommendation which is touching on a Follow-up by the Committee of Infrastructure, Energy and Public Works concerning the condemned buildings and there is a recommendation that the Committee of Infrastructure follows up with the Department of Infrastructure so that a response, a report can be made to that effect and maybe something can be done as of what was requested by the letter. I have not yet seen the letter, I do not know whatever is in the letter but I know with the follow-up we will get to know the content of the letter and report back to the House appropriately.

Madam Speaker, there is only a point whereby I want to give a comment like the degrading projects whereby the report has stated that sometimes it takes long before these projects are occupied and this one results in degrading. I want to disagree. It is my belief that it is only the workmanship because a house sometimes can be designed and the design life of this building is at least 50 years and if you get a situation whereby a project is completed maybe one year it has not been commissioned and it starts degrading then that one brings us to a conclusion that the project was not well done, was not well implemented. Maybe it is a matter of ratios. If it was a construction involving the use of cement, sand and even ballast it is the issue of ratios. Maybe if it is painting, you may have got that the building was painted cream and now the color is changing. It has a lot to do with the quality of the products.

So I believe that one is just the quality. If we do not get it right when we are doing the implementation the results will be there and now we cannot limit on maybe the time that the house takes before it is occupied. In fact it is the occupation of the house that sometimes can bring some degrading even some dirt on the paint and what have you. So it is my opinion that this is the small correction that I wanted to make. But I believe that if we go this way then we are now going to get it right. We should not just let the County Executive do the work as we sit in the Assembly. But when we go out there and try to check whatever they are doing then I know in the future these people or the County Executive, our Engineers, or experts, the contractors they will implement our projects to the standards that are specified in the BQs and they will do a quality job. Otherwise, thank you very much. I support.

The Temporary Speaker (Hon. Caren (MCA, Kaloleni/Shaurimoyo): Yes, Honourable Dede.

Hon. Dede (MCA, Kisumu North): Thank you Madam Speaker. I also have a comment to make on this report. First, I congratulate the team for the work well done. This is because we sit in the Assembly and we have got the three roles to do which are the Legislative part, Oversight role and Representation. The bit that this House Committee did was oversight which was splendidly done. Moreso, is to appreciate them, they decided to select on Wards and a project in each and every Ward was visited.

Madam Speaker, my worry is concerning the report that this House Committee has brought, you realize that in some projects which they visited, like the one, an ECD, Dago Thim ECD which was done and this House Committee has brought the remarks concerning the work done. We found out that the work was done and funds appropriated were Kshs 1.6 million. It stated that the money has been paid, yet if you walk at the ground, there is still claims lodged by the contractors of not being paid.

So, I urge the Committee that while doing the research, they should see that even if the work has been done and they receive the information from the department that the work done has been paid for, they should do the follow-up to see if the work was really paid for because the contractors are really crying outside claiming that they have not been paid.

Secondly, Madam Speaker, concerning a project they visited at East Kano/Wawithi. There was a project indicated as one for fencing. It is good they did everything and the work was done 100 per cent to completion and since the work was completed about two years ago, the contractors have not yet handed over the project to the community to start utilizing and we find that the facility is starting to depredate with a sighs of crumbling walls. This House Committee also recommends that the urgent measures should be taken that there should be some allocation on the budget in the subsequent Financial Year so that we do the renovation and my take is that the project should be handed over immediately so that even if the renovations take place after we have seen the value for money.

Madam Speaker, let us look at another area in Seme. Madam Speaker, it is good that this House Committee decided to visit the St. Barnabas Water Project and likely enough, the Standing Committee on Water and Environment made a site visit in January and what we found at the ground was that no work was done. Madam Speaker, after our site visitation, I am seeing that something has been done. It means after the visitation by the Standing Committee on Water and Environment, the department decided to do something and it is stated in this report that work done was 100 per cent to completion and the department's remark shows that it is functional. This is because the Select Committee on Implementation decided to visit the project physically, they found that the project is not functional. So it means there is disparity of information being brought to the Floor and with that, it should be noted that the department should be clearly invited to the Assembly to state what transpires because if the department shows their remark

that the work is completed and it is functional and the oversight team goes to the ground, finds that there is nothing that took place, I believe that this Department should be invited to the Assembly so that they explain to this House what indeed is meant in their reporting.

Madam Speaker, another concern is in regards to the project visited in North West Kisumu, the Shivalu Water Project. It also stated that the project, the tank which was erected is functional and yet when the Committee undertook a site visit to the project, in the department's recommendation shows that it is functional and when the committee decided to come up with, to visit the site, there is nothing which is going on and it does not have the value for money. Madam Speaker, as a House we should also visited it and the recommendations that the Implementation Committee got is what we also found at the ground that the size of the tank was not as per the stated in the Bill of Quantity.

Madam Speaker, similarly, if we move to another project in Muhoroni Koru Ward, Madam Speaker, I am worried with the project known as the Electrical Work and Equipping of Gold Dispensary. It seems that the Kshs 3,000,000 (three million only) was allocated for the project. These amounts were paid, and work done to completion of 100 per cent. Again, if you move on, it is that there is another location in a subsequent Financial Year, the same Kshs 3,000,000 (three million only), what is this amount going to do? As a House we have not been informed about the BQ of what the purpose intended for the Kshs 3,000,000 (three million only). This is because this amount was consumed; work done to completion, the three million allocated in the same Financial Year does not state the scope of work which is to be done in the subsequent Financial Year.

Madam Speaker, moving to Page 29, my worry is with regards to the project in Central Nyakach Ward, where there is a proposed completion of Pap Onditi Market. The allocated amount was Kshs 15 million, and the amount paid is not indicated, amount of work done, not indicated. Madam Speaker, termination was done, they would have indicated at what particular point was the termination done, what percentage of work had already been covered in Pap Onditi, so that we have the clarity over the allocated money, Madam Speaker.

Finally, as per the recommendations of this House Committee, it's important that this House Committee, yes so it is prudent to invite the department so that they come and bring the clarity over the project status, this is because funds were appropriated. So, I concur with this House Committee that let the department appear before the relevant House Committee and explain concerning the status and compare whatever we found at the ground and make it clear that the taxpayers' money is well utilized for the intended purpose. Otherwise, Madam Speaker, I support the report. Thank you.

The Temporary Speaker (Hon. Carren (MCA, Kaloleni Shaurimoyo): Yes, Honourable Benny Oiko Pete.

Hon. Oiko (MCA, Kabonyo Kanyagwal): Madam Speaker, this statement was raised by me, and there was a time a response was brought to this House, and I applaud the Members of the Assembly for the action they took on that day. They showed their real oversight role, which is in order.

Madam Speaker, today as we look at this report, the report does not adequately answer the matters that were raised. The key matters which were raised in this report were the Ward-based projects. This is because during that financial year, each ward was allocated about Kshs 20 million. We wanted to see the Kshs 20 million that was awarded to each ward, what projects were to be done, which projects were there per department, and were they done to completion, are they ongoing, or are they still? That is not there, Madam Speaker.

Madam Speaker, when I look at this report, every department was notified to respond to that matter, and this House Committee is not clear whether each department responded, giving a picture that they did not respond to the request of this House Committee. This House Committee in its wisdom decided to go to the ground, which is good to verify.

Madam Speaker, when you look at this report, on the committee going to the ground, from page 10 to I believe pages 30, this House Committee has struggled to identify one project per ward. That is what this House Committee has tabulated here, a project per ward. When you look at page 29, that is in South West Nyakach, Completion of Radienya -Kodola Road. That is a project in South West Nyakach. You go to South East Nyakach, what? Completion of Nyamaroka-Pap Ndege-Bodi Road. They have identified each project per ward. The other projects, they have not bothered to tell us the status. That is ward-based. This is falling short of what the questions wanted to be answered.

Madam Speaker, when you go through this report, the flagship projects are not touched. Leaving the question;

- a) Were they there?
- b) Were they done?
- c) Did they stall? Or what happened?

Madam Speaker, this kind of question is a good way of interrogating the work of the government. It will give us a picture of what is transpiring on the ground and more so, we shall be able to know which wards were favoured and which wards were given only Kshs 10 million.

Those were now the silent features that were needed. That will have come out if the questions were adequately answered. Madam Speaker, as we go on, on some pages which are not numbered, and other members have raised this from time to time, that all the pages in the report should be numbered for easy reference and I beg that you order that. There are visits to the wards. It's also captured but the pages are not numbered. Then, when we go to the last page of this report, details of projects, financial year 2022-2023. This is extracted from the approved

budget, which is not bad. This will give us the picture. But we wanted clear information on this project. Like the flagship project;

- a) Moi Stadium which was allocated Kshs 50 million, was it done?
- b) Development of Kit Mikayi, East Seme, was it done?

So, fellow Honourable Members, we need to know from the County Executive whether each financial year, work is being done adequately or not and when the departments cannot give a response to this kind of question, there is a big question mark. What is going on in the government? This is because the details of projects that is given here, who was supposed to execute them? Who was supposed to implement them? Is it the County Executive?

Madam Speaker, so are we informing our people that only the one project per ward explained here were the projects that the County Executive did? The detailed projects were not done? If that kind of information, clear information, cannot be brought to this Assembly.

Madam Speaker, Honourable Rakwach was questioning the content of the statement and the content of the statement is on page 8 of this report. So this House Committee and Honourable Members, if we don't take the County Executive to task, projects will not be done. A lot of things will be in the budget which we don't understand and we shall have failed in our oversight role. So, my plea to the Honourable Members is that the questions sought are not adequately responded to and why the Department of Finance could not give an adequate answer, is the big question.

So, I plead with the Honourable Members, we take the matter back to them. We want specific answers. I so contribute, Madam Speaker.

The Temporary Speaker (Hon. Ajwang', MCA, Kaloleni/Shaurimoyo): Yes, Honourable Mickey Ochieng.

Hon. Mickey (Nominated Member): Thank you Madam Speaker, as a member of the Select Committee on Implementation; there are some things that I probably just want to explain or maybe expound on a bit. A question was raised on the Floor of the House. The committee did their job as best they could.

Madam Speaker, our task is to enquire from the County Executive, which we did. And of course we got answers. From what we got from the County Executive or the respondent, our job was to scan through the report that was sent back to us and look at glaring gaps in the projects that was given in the reports, which we did. We could not go to all the projects, Madam Speaker. We tried to scan the ones that were glaring and the gaps were actually really big to go to.

Madam Speaker, it is my belief that this was adequately captured in the report that we sent back. Madam Speaker, I am not sure if Honourable Member from Kabonyo-Kanyagwal has a specific question.

(Hon. Dede rises on a Point of Order)

Hon. Dede (MCA, Kisumu North): Point of information, Madam Speaker.

The Temporary Speaker (Hon. Ajwang', MCA, Kaloleni/Shaurimoyo): Yes, Honourable Dede, what do you want to say?

Hon. Dede (MCA, Kisumu North): Madam Speaker, I am concerned about the member currently speaking. I'm unsure whether the Member is making a contribution or responding to the statement made by the Honourable Member.

The Temporary Speaker (Hon. Ajwang', MCA, Kaloleni/Shaurimoyo): Proceed, Honourable Mickey.

Hon. Mickey (Nominated Member): Thank you Madam Speaker. I'm a Member of this House Committee that presented this report and I believe I stated as such, I am contributing as a member of the said House Committee.

(Hon. Oiko interjects with a Point of Order)

The Temporary Speaker (Hon. Ajwang', MCA, Kaloleni/Shaurimoyo): Yes Honourable Oiko

Hon. Oiko (MCA, Kabonyo Kanyagwal): Madam Speaker, the Member is right to contribute and to challenge by submission. That is what the Member is doing and she is right in contributing in her own way and challenge my contribution. Madam Speaker, that is allowed.

The Temporary Speaker (Hon. Ajwang', MCA, Kaloleni/Shaurimoyo): Honourable Pete, please use the microphone so that you are audible.

Hon. Oiko (MCA, Kabonyo/Kanyagwal): Madam Speaker, I'm saying that the Member has the right to contribute and challenge my contribution. It will only be logical when the Member is citing facts.

The Temporary Speaker (Hon. Ajwang', MCA, Kaloleni/Shaurimoyo): Honourable Mickey, proceed.

Hon. Mickey (Nominated Member): Thank you, Madam Speaker. I support this report. If the Honourable Member feels that certain areas have not been adequately addressed, the Member should raise those specific concerns. However, as a House Committee, our responsibility was not to focus on a single issue but to review all projects, as the mandate was to examine all the projects within this County. I support. Thank you.

The Temporary Speaker (Hon. Ajwang', MCA, Kaloleni/Shaurimoyo): Yes, Commissioner Pamela.

Hon. Oyoo (MCA, Migosi): Thank you, Madam Speaker. I wish to call upon the mover to reply.

The Temporary Speaker (Hon. Ajwang', MCA, Kaloleni/Shaurimoyo): Honourable James Were.

Hon. Were (MCA, Nyalenda "B"): Thank you Madam Speaker. I would like to take this opportunity to first thank and congratulate Honourable Oiko Pete for providing us with the agenda for this discussion. It is through his initiative that we were assigned this task as a House Committee.

Madam Speaker and Honourable Member, as I mentioned during my report presentation, we were working within a specific timeline set by the Honourable Speaker. We were given seven days to complete this task. Considering that Kisumu County has nearly 35 wards, each with multiple ongoing or completed projects, Madam Speaker, we had to take a sample of the projects due to the limited time and were unable to visit them all.

Madam Speaker, we identified several cases that required intervention and developed a set of recommendations. If these are implemented, proper checks and balances will be established.

Madam Speaker, I would also like to thank all the Honourable Members who have contributed to this discussion, whether in support or opposition. In this Honourable House, we often disagree to agree, and at times, agree to disagree.

Madam Speaker, it appears that Honourable Pete is not fully satisfied, as the Member has mentioned that this House Committee did not adequately address all his concerns raised in the statement or motion. However, Madam Speaker, one of the recommendations is that the matter be referred to the General Oversight Committee. If there are minor issues that this House Committee did not address, we will have another opportunity to do so.

Madam Speaker, with regards to the various projects mentioned, such as the Kshs 20 or 10 million allocated to Ward-based and Flagship Projects like Moi Stadium, we will have the chance to thoroughly investigate these matters and reach a conclusion during the General Oversight meeting. I would also like to clarify that we were working within a specific timeline. Nonetheless, I want to thank Members of this House Committee for their dedication and for taking the time to visit the sites and provide a clearer picture to this Honourable House.

I also want to thank our Secretariat for having worked tirelessly to ensure that this report is delivered. Otherwise, Madam Speaker, I beg to reply.

The Temporary Speaker (Hon. Ajwang', MCA, Kaloleni/Shaurimoyo): Honourable Members, now that the motion on adoption of the Report of the Select Committee on Implementation on

the Implementation Status of the Projects Approved in the Fiscal Year 2022/2023 has been presented, seconded, and debated, I want to put a question on the adoption of the same.

(Question put and agreed to)

The Temporary Speaker (Hon. Ajwang', MCA, Kaloleni/Shaurimoyo): Honourable Members, the motion on the Adoption of the Report of the Select Committee on Implementation on the Implementation Status of the Projects Approved in the fiscal year 2022/2023 has been adopted today, Wednesday, 11th September 2024 at 10:19 hours.

Honourable Members, I direct that the recommendations of this report and of the House debate be forwarded to the relevant departments for action and implementation. Additionally, I equally direct that the Select Committee on Implementation follow up on the implementation of the same. Thank you.

The Temporary Speaker (Hon. Ajwang', MCA, Kaloleni/Shaurimoyo): Next order!!

ADJOURNMENT

The Temporary Speaker (Hon. Carren, MCA, Kaloleni/Shaurimoyo): Honourable Members, there being no any other business to transact, this House stands adjourned until today, Wednesday, 11th September 2024 at 02.30 p.m.

(House rose at 10.20 a.m.)

Addendum

Hansard Team

<i>Zablon Otiende</i>	-	<i>Senior Hansard Reporter (Acting Editor)</i>
<i>Edward Odanga</i>	-	<i>Hansard Reporter</i>
<i>Fanuel Okode</i>	-	<i>Hansard Reporter</i>
<i>Patrick Okoyo</i>	-	<i>Hansard Reporter</i>
<i>Jesca Otieno</i>	-	<i>Hansard Reporter</i>
<i>Jacklyne Otieno</i>	-	<i>Hansard Reporter</i>
<i>Valery Achieng'</i>	-	<i>Hansard Reporter</i>
<i>Jactone Obonyo</i>	-	<i>Attache'</i>